



DGII/EDU/RECO(2023)12

Original: English

Strasbourg, 10 November 2023

Implementation of the Council of Europe Higher Education programme in 2023  
and priorities for the future programme 2024-27

## **Report to the Bologna Follow Up Group**

DGII-Democracy and Human Dignity (Directorate of Democratic Participation/Education  
Department) Secretariat contact: [catherine.dreyer@coe.int](mailto:catherine.dreyer@coe.int)

## Introduction

The paper is structured in the following way:

There is an overview of the general political context of the Council of Europe and its influence on its higher education programme.

This is followed by an update on the current activities (in 2023) for each of the higher education projects, as well as key priorities and foreseen outputs for 2024-2025.

## General political context

In May 2023, the Fourth Council of Europe Summit of the Heads of States and Government was held in Reykjavik. Through the adoption of the Reykjavik Principles of Democracy, 46 Heads of State and Government committed themselves to "invest in a DEMOCRATIC FUTURE by ensuring that everyone is able to play their part in democratic processes. Priority will be given to supporting the participation of young people in democratic life and decision-making processes, including through **education on human rights** and core democratic values such as pluralism, inclusion, non-discrimination, transparency and accountability".

The 26<sup>th</sup> session of the Council of Europe Standing Conference of Ministers of Education entitled 'The transformative power of education: universal values and civic renewal' took place in Strasbourg on 27 and 28 September 2023. At this Ministerial Conference the Council of Europe member States reaffirmed their commitment on the critical role of education in promoting democracy, human rights, and the rule of law, recognising the need for decisive action to address global challenges, strengthening the Council of Europe's education implementation mechanisms, and focusing on the democratic future for all learners through initiatives and adopted resolutions.

The main themes of the Ministerial Conference were the renewal of education's civic mission, education in times of emergencies and crisis, harnessing the potential of digital transformation in education. At this meeting, the Ministers also adopted the **Council of Europe 2030 Education Strategy "Learners First"**, which endorses the values of the Council of Europe.

The Strategy not only provides the vision for the Council of Europe work in the field of education but also includes a Roadmap for its Programme of Activities 2024-2027.

All documents of the Ministerial Conference can be consulted on the [dedicated website](#).

## The Council of Europe Higher Education Programme

Following the internal restructuring of the Education Department in 2022, the intergovernmental work and capacity building projects in the field of higher education are now more closely aligned.

The higher education programme of the Council of Europe comprises the programmes related to the implementation of the Lisbon Recognition Convention, including its Co-Secretariat, running (jointly with UNESCO) of the ENIC Network; democratic mission of higher education, Platform on Ethics, Transparency and Integrity in Education (ETINED), European Qualifications Passport for Refugees and the Joint EU/CoE Project 'Supporting an efficient national mechanism of recognition of refugees' qualifications in Italy'.

The work in the field of higher education is overseen by the Sub-Group on higher education policy of the Steering Committee for Education (CDEDU). The CDEDU Sub-Group reports to the Council of Europe Steering Committee for Education, which comprises representatives of public authorities responsible for education from the 46 member States of the Council of Europe, Holy See and Kazakhstan and a number of observers.

Through the adoption of its new terms of reference in October 2023, the CDEDU Sub-Group on Higher Education has been reinforced and its membership has been enlarged from 13 to 24 members, comprising representatives of Ministries, in charge of higher education, as well as academic representatives and international NGOs. To ensure better coordination of work with the Bologna Process, the Vice-Chair of the EHEA has been invited to join the Sub-Group.

## **I. Work in the field of recognition of qualifications**

### **1. Lisbon Recognition Convention Committee**

#### **Overview**

Together with UNESCO, the Council of Europe ensures the Secretariat of the Lisbon Recognition Convention (LRC). The Lisbon Recognition Convention is one of the most ratified Conventions in the Council of Europe and it remains the only legally binding text in the European Higher Education Area. The last ratifications of the Convention were by Monaco and Turkmenistan (entry into force on the 1<sup>st</sup> May 2023), which brought the number of contracting Parties to 56.

#### **Developments in 2023**

At the 9<sup>th</sup> session of the Lisbon Recognition Convention Committee, which took place in Strasbourg on 15 November 2022, Mr Luca Lantero, the President of the LRCC, informed the Committee that, on November 11, 2022, he had received a written communication from one of the Parties to the Lisbon Recognition Convention. This message recalled the decisions of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe [CM/Del/Dec\(2022\)1438/2.3](#) from the 30 June 2022 and [CM/Del/Dec\(2022\)1445/10.4](#) from the 5 October 2022 inviting, where relevant, each body representing all the Parties of treaties to which the Russian Federation and Belarus remain a Party, to decide, on the basis of its rules of procedure, on the modalities of participation of the Russian Federation and Belarus in the respective body, and requested to add an additional item to the agenda of the 9<sup>th</sup> session of the Lisbon Recognition Convention Committee on 15 November 2022 to discuss arranging a special meeting to discuss these points.

The extraordinary session of the Lisbon Recognition Convention Committee took place on 28 February 2023 in Paris. The meeting adopted a declaration on restricting the participation of the Russian Federation and Belarus. The text of the declaration can be found [here](#) .

#### **Key priorities in 2024-2027**

The follow up to the monitoring report will be carried out within the Workplan 2023-2025 by the Lisbon Recognition Convention Bureau.

The Bureau will pursue its work on:

- Finalising the update of the ENIC- NARIC Charter
- Updating the 'Revised Code of Good Practice in the Provision of Transnational Education' (2007)

Drafting a new text on 'digital solutions', taking into account the existing 'Guidelines for national online information systems' (2019);

## **2. Contribution to the ENIC-NARIC Networks**

### **Overview**

Since 1994 the Council of Europe has been actively involved in running jointly with UNESCO the European Network of National Information Centres (ENIC). It is run jointly with the National Academic Recognition Information Centres (NARIC) network, which was established in 1984 with the European Commission as Secretariat.

The ENIC-NARIC networks have joint initiatives, linked to supporting exchange on qualifications-recognition information on policies and practices and providing an opportunity for capacity building activities, as well as participating in consultative processes on international normative instruments related to qualification recognition.

For the efficient functioning of both the Lisbon Recognition Convention and the ENIC and NARIC Networks the renewal process is constantly required, given new developments in the field of higher education, such as the digitization, automatic recognition, micro-credentials, recognition of non-formal and informal education and recognition of prior learning, transnational education.

### **Developments in 2023**

The activities of the Networks until the 2023 annual meeting were organised around the EB/NAB (ENIC Bureau/NARIC Advisory Board) 2021-2023 workplan, according to five dimensions.

The focus of the ENIC and NARIC Networks activities in 2023 was the organisation of the 2023 annual meeting in Stockholm. The annual meeting included plenary sessions and hosted twelve parallel workshops on topical issues of recognition.

The Council of Europe was involved in the three workshops linked to the topics of the Revision of the ENIC-NARIC Charter, Academic Integrity and Capacity-Building (support to the ENIC Projects).

Elections were held at the 2023 annual meeting for the ENIC Bureau. Chiara Finocchietti (Italy) was elected as the ENIC President. The elected two ENIC Vice-Presidents are Dženan Omanović (Bosnia and Herzegovina) and Paul Norris (UK).

Elections were also held for the NARIC Advisory Board. The elected members for the 2023-2025 term are Gunnar Vaht (Estonia), Helén Sophie Haugen (Norway) and Gianina Chirazi (Romania).

In 2023, for the first time, the Council of Europe launched a call to support ENIC centres, which are not eligible for the NARIC call and are part of the CoE Education Programme.

As a result of the call for pilot projects, nine applications were received for funding. Out of these applications the evaluation board decided to support six projects from the following countries: Albania, Armenia, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Georgia, Ukraine and United Kingdom. The projects will be implemented until the end of 2023, some of the final conferences have already taken place, as in the case of Armenia.

The topics range from the recognition of refugees' qualifications to combatting education fraud to stepping up the capacity of the National Information Centres through enhanced training of credential evaluators.

### **Key priorities in 2024-2027**

- Contribute to the organisation of annual ENIC-NARIC meetings (in 2024 - in Naples, Italy; in 2025 – in Albania);
- Contribute to the implementation of the 2023-2025 Workplan of the Networks;
- Build up the capacity of the ENIC centres, which are part of the Council of Europe Education Programme through projects selected through annual calls for projects;
- Develop and adopt a standard-setting instrument on automatic recognition by the end of 2025.

### **3. Automatic Recognition**

In 2023, the Council of Europe set up an Ad Hoc Working Group on automatic recognition of qualifications. Its terms of reference were adopted by the CDEDU Bureau at its meeting in February 2023.

According to its terms of reference, the purpose of this Group is to:

- Exchange views on the current developments, related to establishing the right to automatic recognition, making good use of the trial-and-error experiences across Europe;
- Advise the Council of Europe Steering Committee on Education on different possibilities and prepare an option paper to establish a legally binding text on automatic recognition.
- The Council of Europe Ad Hoc Working Group on Automatic Recognition of Qualifications, chaired by the CDEDU Vice-Chair, had its first meeting in the beginning of May 2023 in Brussels and its second meeting in Strasbourg in September 2023.
- Throughout Autumn and Winter of 2023/ 2024, the Working Group will organise consultations with the key stakeholders, notably students, higher education institutions and public authorities in charge of higher education.

In March 2024 the Ad Hoc Working Group will report to the plenary session of the Council of Europe Steering Committee for Education on its progress.

### **4. Recognition of refugees' qualifications:**

There are currently two initiatives implemented in this field: the [European Qualifications Passport for Refugees \(EQPR\)](#) and the joint European Union and Council of Europe project '[Supporting an efficient national mechanism of recognition of refugees' qualifications](#)' in Italy.

## **a) The European Qualifications Passport for Refugees (EQPR)-**

### **An overview**

The European Qualifications Passport for Refugees (EQPR) is a Council of Europe initiative aiming at facilitating the recognition of refugees' qualifications even in the absence of full documentation. The EQPR and the methodology on which it is based are used by the national information centres on recognition of qualifications (ENICs/NARICs) and higher education institutions in States Parties to the Lisbon Recognition Convention to assess qualifications held by refugees that cannot be adequately documented, in accordance with Article VII of the Lisbon Recognition Convention and the Recommendation on Recognition of Qualifications Held by Refugees, Displaced Persons and Persons in a Refugee-like Situation.

The European Qualifications Passport for Refugees, supported by twenty-two countries<sup>1</sup> and the UNHCR, is also endorsed by all countries members of the European Higher Education Area through [Rome Communiqué](#) in 2020.

The EQPR should eliminate unnecessary and repeated further assessments of the same qualifications in other European countries if and when the EQPR holder moves. The EQPR does not constitute a formal recognition act, and it will not give access to study programs or profession with specific requirements, such as most regulated profession (typically medical doctor, dentist, lawyer, engineer), but it does set out the attainment of the individual.

The EQPR is used by local authorities, employers, higher education institutions and NGOs for better integration of refugees into their new societies through employment and access to higher education.

### **Developments in 2023**

The number of countries participating in the EQPR has been continuously growing. San Marino and Georgia are the latest countries to join the project in January and March 2023 respectively, bringing the overall number of participating countries to 22.

Overall, by the end of September 2023, 1015 candidates had been interviewed and 868 EPQRs have been issued.

More than 80 credential evaluators from 22 participating ENICs are now trained on the EQPR methodology, which increases the capacity of the project to promote the EQPR as a valid and trustful tool to assess qualifications of refugees without sufficient documentation.

The EQPR project is developing synergies and cooperates with the UNESCO Qualifications Passport for Refugees and Vulnerable Migrants, which is targeting countries outside the European Region. The coordination is carried out both at the strategic level, as well as on a technical level.

The EQPR will be presented at the High-Level Ministerial round Table on 'Transforming Higher Education in Crisis and Emergencies', which will take place on 29<sup>th</sup> November, in Doha, during the 11<sup>th</sup> biennial World Innovation Summit for Education.

The Council of Europe will also participate and present the EQPR achievements at the upcoming Global Refugee Forum (GRF) in Geneva from 13 to 15 December 2023.

<sup>1</sup> Albania, Andorra, Armenia, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Canada, Croatia, France, Germany, Georgia, Greece, Ireland, Italy, Latvia, Monaco, the Netherlands, Norway, Poland, Portugal, Republic of Moldova, Romania, Serbia, United Kingdom

**b) The Joint European Union/Council of Europe project ‘Supporting an efficient national mechanism of recognition of refugees’ qualifications’ in Italy.**

Italy became the first country in which the Council of Europe is upscaling the use of the EQPR methodology, through the joint European Union and Council of Europe project “[Supporting an efficient national mechanism of recognition of refugees’ qualifications](#)”. This project is co-funded by the European Union via the Technical Support Instrument and implemented by the Council of Europe in co-operation with the European Commission Directorate-General for Structural Reform Support.

The general objective of the project is to support Italian authorities in their efforts to design and foster reforms for recognising refugees’ qualifications through the development of a national coordination mechanism within public sectors, in and beyond academia.

Through tailored activities, this technical support will contribute to improving the capacity of public administration bodies to process applications for recognising refugees’ qualifications and to increasing pathways for refugees in regulated professions.

The project is implemented from 1 September 2022 through 31 August 2024

**Key priorities from 2024 through 2027**

In order to implement the CoE Education Strategy, in particular one of its priority themes ‘**Enhancing education’s social responsibility and responsiveness**’, it is important to upscale the implementation of the EQPR as an important instrument for ensuring opportunities for equal access at all levels of education for all learners, including vulnerable groups, migrants and refugees.

This could be done in several ways:

- At a policy level: by developing a Council of Europe legal instrument. This could take form of a Committee of Ministers Recommendation on Valuing the Academic and Professional Skills of Refugees in Europe, containing principles and guidelines. For this purpose an Ad Hoc Drafting Group has been set up by the Steering Committee for Education at its last meeting on the 3-5 April 2023.
- On a practical level: by increasing the number of the EQPR countries. This could be done through promotion efforts and by targeting the ENIC and NARIC networks, as well as through support of the projects through the ENIC calls. The target could be to have by 2027 at least 50 % of the Council of Europe member States on board.
- Through close co-operation with UNESCO to promote the EQPR in the European region as an important instrument for the implementation of the UNESCO Global Convention.

## **II. Democratic mission of higher education**

### **Overview and developments of 2023**

The work on the democratic mission of higher education is strongly linked to the fundamental values of the Council of Europe, respecting human rights, democracy and the rule of law.

For the last twenty years, this work has been mainly carried out through the cooperation of four pillar organisations: the Council of Europe; the International Association of Universities; the International Consortium for Higher Education, Civic Responsibility, and Democracy; and the Organization of American States, jointly forming the Global Cooperation for the Democratic Mission of Higher Education.

In 2023, the Council of Europe developed a new project on this topic entitled “Academic Freedom in Action”, which will run from 2024 through 2027.

The project consists of three main strands:

#### **Theme 1: Academic Freedom in action**

Design the methodology of a mapping of a level of protection of academic freedom in member states, in line with the CM/Rec (2012)7 and in order to formulate recommendation for public authorities in charge of higher education policies;

Draw up an action plan on policy advice and awareness raising in order to harmonise the contrasting policies pursued by countries and individual institutions in the name of academic freedom; Develop guidelines for public authorities and higher education institutions.

#### **Theme 2: Democratisation of science and the local mission of higher education**

The democratisation of science refers to efforts aimed at increasing public access, participation and understanding of scientific knowledge and processes. It encompasses various aspects, including making scientific information more accessible, promoting scientific literacy, engaging diverse communities in scientific endeavours, and fostering public involvement in scientific decision-making.

**Theme 3: Digital/AI challenges in Higher Education** with two sub-topics “Academic Freedom in the advent of the digital society” and “Algorithmic Discrimination in Higher Education’.

To implement this project the Working Group will be set up and the call for experts will be launched in early 2024.

The proceedings of the Global Forum, which was held in Dublin in June 2022 will be published until the end of the year.



### III. The Pan-European Platform on Ethics, Transparency and Integrity in Education(ETINED)

#### An overview and developments in 2023

The ETINED Platform is a network of specialists appointed by member States of the Council of Europe and of States Parties to the European Cultural Convention. Its mission is to:

- Share information and good practices in the field of transparency and integrity in education;
- Contribute to the development of adequate answers to challenges that corruption poses to the sector of education and higher education;
- Create a virtuous cycle in education, whereby all actors commit to fundamental positive ethical principles;
- Develop capacity-building for all actors.

Since its launch in 2015, the [Platform](#) has produced guidelines for ensuring a culture of ethics in the teaching profession. It has developed targeted recommendations on academic integrity following assessments and exchanges with the actors on the ground. f On 13 July 2022, the Committee of Ministers [Recommendation](#) CM/Rec (2022) 18 on countering education fraud was adopted.

Following the Committee of Ministers Recommendation CM/Rec (2022) 18, the ETINED Platform identified three priority areas for the further development of activities. They touch respectively upon the areas of raising awareness (i.e. through a publication of research studies based on a baseline questionnaire submitted to the ETINED delegates; drafting of a glossary on education fraud; holding moderated online discussions with renowned speakers on emerging topics related to education fraud); prevention, and monitoring of education fraud.

The 7<sup>th</sup> ETINED Plenary session will take place on 14 and 15 November 2023 in Paris.

Among other items, main discussion points of the Plenary will be:

- Setting up an Observatory on Countering Fraud in Education;
- Expanding the project FraudS+ “Student Awareness on Fraud in Education” to enlarge the scope of participating Council of Europe member States;
- Approving a Glossary based on the Committee of Ministers Recommendation CM/Rec (2022) 18 on countering education fraud.

## Conclusions

**In order to support the implementation of the Council of Europe Education Strategy, in 2024 -2027 the Council of Europe Higher Education Sector identified the following priorities:**

- Develop the Council of Europe Students' Rights Charter;
- Promote the upholding of fundamental values of higher education through the project "Academic Freedom in Action".
- Prepare the implementation review report of the CM/Rec (2012) 7 on the responsibility of public authorities for academic freedom and institutional autonomy
- Organise the next Global Forum in 2025, taking into consideration the priorities of the Education Strategy in defining the topic;
- Promote automatic recognition of qualifications to support internationalization of higher education, particularly to remove obstacles of vulnerable groups by adopting a standard-setting instrument;
- Support academic mobility, in particular by enhancing the implementation of the Lisbon Recognition Convention and promoting the ENIC Network and its cooperation with the NARIC Network;
- Support the recognition of qualifications for refugees through the European Qualification Passport for Refugees, including through adopting the CM Recommendation and policy guidelines;.
- Set up an Observatory or Monitoring Mechanism on Countering Fraud in Education;
- Contribute to policy guidelines on open school data to improve transparency and accountability in education;
- Contribute to the proposal for the development of a draft legal instrument to regulate the use of artificial intelligence systems in education to protect human rights, democracy and the rule of law, in light of the provisions of the future Council of Europe Framework Convention on Artificial Intelligence, Human Rights, Democracy and the Rule of Law;
- Contribute to the preparation of the draft recommendation on teaching and learning about artificial intelligence.