

**MEETING OF THE BOLOGNA FOLLOW-UP GROUP
Stockholm, 28-29 September 2009**

Draft outcome of proceedings

Participants

Country / Organisation	Name
Swedish Presidency	Eino Örnfeldt
Swedish Presidency	Myrna Smitt (Chair)
Albania	Alexander Xhuvani
Andorra	Enric M. Garcia
Armenia	Gayane Harutyunyan
Armenia	Mher Melik-Bakhshyan
Armenia	Alexander Ter-Hovakimyan
Austria	Barbara Weitgruber (Vice-Chair)
Austria	Gottfried Bacher
Belgium /Flemish Community	Magalie Soenen
Belgium /Flemish Community	Noël Vercruysse
Belgium /French Community	Kevin Guillaume
Bosnia and Herzegovina	Petar Marić
Croatia	Tomislav Vodička
Cyprus	Efstathios Michael
Czech Republic	Věra Štastná
Denmark	Helle Otte
Denmark	Torben Kornbech Rasmussen
Estonia	Heli Aru
Finland	Maija Innola
Finland	Birgitta Vuorinen
France	Hélène Lagier
France	Chantal Manes
France	Yves Vallat
Georgia	Nino Svanadze
Germany	Peter Greisler
Germany	Birger Hendriks
Greece	Foteini Asderaki
Holy See	P. Friedrich Bechina
Hungary	László Csekei
Hungary	János Csirik (Vice-Chair)
Iceland	Hellen Gunnarsdottir
Ireland	Laura Casey
Italy	Marzia Foroni
Italy	Maria Sticchi Damiani
Latvia	Andrejs Rauhvargers
Liechtenstein	Helmut Konrad
Lithuania	Rimvydas Labanauskis
Luxembourg	Germain Dondelinger
Malta	Jacques Sciberras
Montenegro	Biljana Misovic
Montenegro	Ljubisa Stankovic
Netherlands	Denise Heiligers
Norway	Toril Johansson
Norway	Tone Flood Strøm

Poland	Maria Boltruszko
Poland	Tomasz Saryusz-Wolski
Portugal	Sebastião Feyo de Azevedo
Romania	Remus Pricopie
Russian Federation	Victor Chistokhvalov
Serbia	Vera Dondur
Serbia	Mirjana Vesovic
Slovenia	Janja Komljenovic
Slovenia	Darinka Vrečko
Spain	Rafael Bonete
Spain	José Ginés Mora Ruiz
Sweden	Åsa Petri
Switzerland	François Grandjean
"the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia"	Nadezda Uzelac
Turkey	Ömer Demir
United Kingdom	Peter Baldwinson
United Kingdom	Alex Young
European Commission	Christian Tauch
European Commission	Sophia Eriksson Waterschoot
European Commission / EURYDICE	David Crosier
BUSINESS EUROPE	Henning Dettleff
Council of Europe	Sjur Bergan
Education International	Nina Gustafsson
Education International	Angele Attard
ENQA	Guy Aelterman
EQAR	Colin Tück
ESU	Andrea Blaettler
ESU	Ligia Deca
EUA	Michael Gaebel
EUA	Lesley Wilson
EURASHE	Stefan Delplace
EURASHE	Lars Lynge Nielsen
UNESCO	Stamenka Uvalic-Trumbic
Bologna Secretariat	Françoise Bourdon
Bologna Secretariat	Marlies Leegwater
Bologna Secretariat	Marie-Anne Persoons
Bologna Secretariat	Cornelia Racké

Welcome and introduction to the meeting

Director General Eino Örnfeldt of the Swedish Ministry of Education and Research welcomed the participants and identified the priorities of the Swedish Presidency. He referred to the meeting of Directors general for higher education to be held in Kalmar on 6-7 October 2009, which will focus on the theme of quality and accountability of higher education institutions.

He handed the Chair of the meeting to Myrna Smitt.

Aija Sadurskis gave information on the practicalities of the meeting.

1. Adoption of the agenda

Documents: BFUG (SE) 18_1a [draft agenda]
BFUG (SE) 18_1b [draft annotated agenda]

The European Commission requested to add an information point under agenda item 8 (on the Report from the European Commission on Quality assurance in higher education). With this adjustment, the BFUG adopted the agenda.

2. Outcome of proceedings of BFUG meeting, Leuven, 27 April 2009 and minutes of Board meeting, Stockholm, 4 September 2009

Documents: BFUG (SE) 18_2a [BFUG Leuven draft outcome of

BFUG approved the outcome of proceedings of the Leuven BFUG meeting and took note of the Board minutes.

3. Information by the Swedish Presidency

The BFUG took note of the information provided by the Swedish Presidency on events in which the Chair of the BFUG had taken or would still take part on behalf of the Bologna Process:

- a meeting of Education International in Stockholm in September 2009.
- a regional meeting of Education Ministers of South East Europe organised by the Council of Europe and the Presidency of the Council of Europe, Ljubljana, 20-21 October;
- a conference on Qualifications Frameworks, Strasbourg, 9-10 November 2009

4. Information by the Bologna Secretariat

Document: BFUG (SE) 18_4 [Bologna Secretariat terms of reference]

The BFUG took note of the information provided by the Bologna Secretariat.

- A template for providing information on seminars to be mentioned on the calendar of the Bologna website will be sent to BFUG in the coming days
- Terms of reference and composition of the Secretariat:

At the Sarajevo BFUG meeting, the Benelux Bologna Secretariat was asked to continue for another year. The terms of reference remain the same as in the two years before, with some small changes in the composition of the Secretariat. In view of the preparation of the Budapest/Vienna Ministerial meeting, Sára Demény (Hungary) and Sabine Neyer (Austria) have joined the Secretariat in July.

Marie-Anne Persoons will leave the Secretariat by the end of November for a position as seconded national expert at the European Commission, DG EAC, EIT Unit. Magalie Soenen will take over part of her duties and join the Bologna Secretariat on behalf of the Flemish Community of Belgium.

ESU pointed to the special situation resulting from the fact that the Secretariat will change during the 2009-2012 working period and suggested to prepare a document explaining the Secretariat's working methods and procedures. Also the responsibility of the Bologna Secretariat to defend the common interest of all countries and organisations participating in the Bologna Process should be highlighted.

5. Follow-up on the Leuven/Louvain-la-Neuve Communiqué

5.1 BFUG Work Plan 2009-2012

Documents: BFUG (SE) 18_5.1a [work plan 2009-2012]
BFUG (SE) 18_5.1b [calendar of events 2009-2012]
BFUG (SE) 18_5.1c [Focus questionnaire]
BFUG (SE) 18_5.1d [Council of Europe QF document]
BFUG (SE) 18_5.1e [EUA/EI/ESU input paper on mobility]

The Chair introduced the work plan, which is a compilation of the expressions of interest of countries and organisations to contribute to the different priority areas.

After discussion the BFUG adopted the general outline of the work plan and gave mandate to the chairs of the following working groups to start their work:

- (1) *Working Group on the Reporting on the Implementation of the Bologna Process*
This group is to prepare the integrated report requested by the Ministers in Leuven/Louvain-la-Neuve for the Bucharest Ministerial meeting on the core

issues of the Bologna Process. The report will contain both quantitative and qualitative elements.

The working group will have a first meeting in Luxembourg, 4 November 2009, including all countries and organisations that have volunteered to take part in the action lines of data collection, refined stocktaking, social dimension and employability, as well as mobility.

During the discussion at the Stockholm BFUG several delegations doubted that it was feasible to include all the work to be done, in particular on mobility and social dimension.

It was agreed that the working group would use its first meeting to come up with a proposal for the organisation of the work. This proposal will indicate whether the work should be followed up in one large group or whether subgroups or separate (but associated) working groups would be necessary to make sure that all relevant issues on policy development and exchange of good practices concerning social dimension, student and staff mobility will be covered. It will also consider what has to be taken up at the national level and/or what could be taken up at the European level. If separate associated working groups on social dimension and/or mobility are set up, they need to propose elaborated terms of reference and will be chaired by Spain and Germany respectively. The necessity to liaise the groups was underlined.

- The final organisation of the work on the reporting on the implementation of the Bologna Process and its terms of reference and, where applicable, of any subgroups or associated working groups, will be presented to the BFUG at its meeting in Brussels, 30 November-1 December 2009 for final approval.

(2) *Working group on the implementation of the qualifications framework*, chaired by the Council of Europe

The BFUG endorsed the proposal of the Council of Europe to organise the follow-up of the implementation of national qualifications frameworks and the necessary coordination at European level by a network of national correspondents complemented by a working group. The BFUG advised that this working group would work in close cooperation with the working group on recognition (see below). In addition to welcoming all who showed interest, the working group chair expressed the wish to have more non-EU countries in the group.

The working group will have its first meeting on 10 November 2009 in Strasbourg.

(3) *Working group on international openness*, chaired by Austria (until June 2010, to be taken over by Romania up to 2012). The BFUG approved the terms of reference for the working group as presented by Austria.

A central task of the working group will be the preparation of the Bologna Policy Forum, Vienna, 12 March 2010, in close cooperation with the BFUG as a whole. Austria also explicitly encouraged non-EU countries to join the group. The BFUG took note of the interest expressed by Armenia and UNESCO to contribute to the work of the working group. The working group will have its first meeting on 28 October 2009 in Vienna.

(4) *Working group on multidimensional transparency tools*, chaired by the Flemish Community of Belgium. The first meeting of the working group will take place in Brussels in the morning of 30 November 2009. Following the recommendation of the Stockholm BFUG meeting, one of the discussion points at this meeting will be the nature and scope of the report that will be prepared for 2012. It will also take into account in the terms of reference that - following the mandate from the Leuven/Louvain-la-Neuve Communiqué, monitoring of current initiatives is the main task of the working group. The working group should also take on board the issue of interaction with existing quality

assurance mechanisms and was suggested to organise a mini-seminar adjacent to a BFUG meeting to present results. With these remarks, the terms of reference of the group were adopted.

(5) *Working group on recognition*, chaired by Latvia. The revised terms of reference for this group as presented by Latvia in the morning of the second day were approved. Following the advice of the BFUG the group should work in close cooperation with the working group on qualifications frameworks. It should also pay attention to mobility issues and new recognition problems which result from the creation of new degrees in Bologna reforms, in particular at Master level (different types of Masters, credit ranges, duration...). To be able to fulfil its mandate, the working group should include both recognition experts/credential evaluators *and* policy-makers/BFUG members. It will hold its first meeting in January 2010. The European Commission, ENQA, Denmark, France and Armenia expressed their interest to join the working group.

- All working groups will regularly report back to the BFUG and present their final reports in time for the BFUG meeting in the second half of 2011.

5.2 Co-Chairing of the Bologna Process (by EU Presidency and non-EU country)

Document: BFUG (SE) 18_5.2 [co-chairing]

In line with the majority of the answers to the questionnaire to BFUG members on the co-chairing of the Bologna Process, the BFUG agreed on the following advice to be given to the Ministers on the co-chairing arrangement for the Bologna Process:

- Both Chairs will act on equal footing
- For the Chairs from the non-EU countries the alphabetical order will be followed, starting with Albania from 1 July 2010 onwards.
- The representation of the EU troika + 3 elected countries will be replaced by the two troikas of current, incoming and outgoing EU and non-EU Chairs.

The following order of countries will be established until the Ministerial meeting of Bucharest in 2012, after which adjustments (e.g. if a non-EU country joins the EU in the meantime) can be made to the arrangement, if necessary.

Semester	EU-Presidency	Chair from non-EU country	Vice-chair
1 July – 31 December 2010	Belgium	Albania	Romania
1 January - 30 June 2011	Hungary	Andorra	
1 July – 31 December 2011	Poland	Armenia	
1 January - 30 June 2012	Denmark	Azerbaijan	

- The Bologna Secretariat was asked to include a list of tasks of the chair(s) of the Bologna Process/BFUG in the background paper for the Ministerial decision on the arrangement of the co-chairing in 2010-2012 to be taken in Budapest and Vienna.

6. Feedback on the Leuven/Louvain-la-Neuve Ministerial Conference and the 1st Bologna Policy Forum

The discussion was combined with agenda item 7.

7. 2010 Ministerial Conference

7.1 Budapest/Vienna Declaration

Document: BFUG (SE) 18_7.1 [Budapest/Vienna Declaration roadmap]

The BFUG approved the roadmap for drafting the Budapest/Vienna Declaration presented by the Vice-Chair, with the small adjustment of also including input from the reports by Eurydice and the consultative members prepared for the Budapest/Vienna Conference.

7.2 Bologna Policy Forum 2010

Austria gave information on the Bologna Policy Forum. The decision on how many and which countries to invite is still pending: will all countries with a higher education system be invited or just a selection of countries? This will be decided by the hosts in consultation with the incoming Spanish Presidency.

The programme of the 2010 Bologna Policy Forum could look as follows:

- The festive gala in the evening of 11 March 2010 will offer a first opportunity for European and non-European Ministers to meet in an informal way.
- While the European Ministers finalise the Declaration in the morning of 12 March 2010, a "briefing session" on the Bologna Process could be offered to the non-European delegations with involvement from the consultative members, presenting the Bologna Process as what it is: a joint venture of governments, students and staff.
- For all EHEA and non-EHEA heads of delegation there will be a joint luncheon before the start of the Bologna Policy Forum.
- The Bologna Policy Forum as such would officially start after lunch with a plenary of 1 hour, followed by working groups of 1,5 hours, and closing with another plenary of 1 hour. The briefing session in the morning should allow the Bologna Policy Forum to focus on real dialogue among partners on issues which are of mutual interest, such as recognition, the global knowledge society, brain circulation, etc.

The details of the language regime for the Bologna Policy Forum still need to be decided. While the Bologna Ministerial Conference will work with English and the languages of the host countries, applying the same format to the Bologna Policy Forum needs further consideration. Apart from French and Spanish, Russian and Arabic were suggested as additional languages.

In the discussion that followed, the delegations made several suggestions. UNESCO made the link to the follow-up of the World Conference for Higher Education and the topic of emerging regional areas for higher education and research.

Underlining the importance of dialogue, Slovenia pointed out that the introductory session for the non-European delegations should not be called "briefing session" to avoid the impression that Europe wanted to "teach" the world.

Several delegates stressed the need for more interaction and for a programme that would make it worthwhile for both European and non-European Ministers to attend. The BFUG was also invited to think about a possible follow-up for the Bologna Policy Forum and to prepare specific proposals for that purpose.

The Austrian and Hungarian hosts will provide more detailed information on the programme of the Bologna Policy Forum at the next BFUG meeting, taking into account the input from BFUG and the first working group meeting on 28 October.

- The BFUG was asked to give further input and suggestions in writing before the meeting of the Austrian-Hungarian coordination group which will meet on 15 October 2009.

7.3 Update on the conference preparations

Documents: BFUG (SE) 18_7.3a [invitation letter]
BFUG (SE) 18_7.3b [draft programme]
BFUG (SE) 18_7.3c [practical information]

The BFUG took note of the information given by the hosts of the 2010 Ministerial Conference.

In reaction to the critical comments received on the arrangement of the rather long reporting session in Leuven/Louvain-la-Neuve, the Austrian and Hungarian hosts have decided to split the reporting over two sessions. They also called upon the support of the stakeholders to find a creative solution in view of an attractive reporting session.

Delegations of maximum 5 persons should include rectors and students. The signatories of the 1999 Bologna Declaration will also be invited to the evening event on 11 March 2010. The registrations will be open from 15 October onwards and close 10 January 2010. Also the hotels should be booked by 10 January.

7.4 Conference languages

Document: BFUG (SE) 18_7.4 [request from Germany]

Germany introduced the proposal that for future Bologna Ministerial Conferences as a rule English + the language(s) of the host country or countries will be offered, unless the host waives its right.

The BFUG approved the proposal for the conferences of European Ministers responsible for higher education.

For the Bologna Policy Forum other rules may apply.

8. EQAR update and extension of mandate of EQAR Committee observers

Document: BFUG (SE) 18_8 [EQAR Update]

The BFUG took note of the information provided by EQAR and decided to extend the mandate of the current observers to the EQAR Committee (Austria, Denmark, Estonia, Ireland, and Portugal) until 30 June 2010 to match the mandate of the EQAR Committee. There was also agreement to elect the five observers for the next period (1 July 2010-30 June 2012) at the BFUG meeting in Madrid, 18-19 February 2009. This implies that countries should present the name of their candidate for election to the Bologna Secretariat by 24 December 2009.

Denmark, followed by several delegations, indicated the necessity to have more clarity on the role of the country observers and on the procedures for their appointment.

- The Bologna Secretariat was asked to prepare a paper on the role and profile of the country observers as well as on related procedural issues mentioned to during the discussion. It will therefore contact the current country observers in the Register Committee for further reference.

Additional information point on quality assurance

The European Commission introduced the first triannual report on progress in quality assurance in higher education. A first discussion will take place at the DG HE meeting in Kalmar. All stakeholders are invited to reflect upon the further

development and ways to ensure the proper implementation of the 2006 Recommendation on European cooperation in quality assurance in higher education. The report can be downloaded from: <http://eur-lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=COM:2009:0487:FIN:EN:PDF>

9. Update on the independent assessment

Documents: BFUG (SE) 18_9a [progress report]
BFUG (SE) 18_9b [invitation letter]

The BFUG took note of the information provided by the European Commission and the researchers on the progress of the independent assessment and the seminar to be held on 1 December 2009 in Brussels.

The progress report was not to be seen as a complete report as some important data are still missing. In particular it appeared difficult to find sound data on social dimension, mobility and attractiveness of the EHEA.

In the discussion that followed, several delegations voiced the concern on the selection of the national contact points to validate the country data and on the selection of case studies, which focused almost exclusively on examples of good practice from North Western Europe and included only one non-EU country. The researchers were asked to consequently use the internationally recognised denomination of Bologna member countries, notably for the FYROM, and to take into account the particular situation of the higher education system of the Holy See.

The European Commission and the researchers replied that the national contact points were independent and professionally engaged in higher education research. They were never meant to be recommended by BFUG. The researchers had met difficulties in finding other than public data on the implementation of the Bologna Process as this depends on institutions.

- As decided before, the report on the results of the independent assessment will be made available to BFUG by 1 November 2009. The researchers of the consortium and the international panel (including experts from the USA, Canada, Latin-America, China, and Saudi Arabia) will be present at the seminar on 1 December,
- The final report, to be submitted in January 2010, will include all the information on the profile of the national contact points, the selection criteria, and the answers given to the questionnaires.

10. Updates from EC and consultative members (written contributions)

Documents: BFUG (SE) 18_10a [CoE update]
BFUG (SE) 18_10b [ESU update]
BFUG (SE) 18_10c [EURASHE update]
BFUG (SE) 18_10d [UNESCO-CEPES update]
BFUG (SE) 18_10e [EI update]

The Commission Green Paper "Promoting the learning mobility of young people", available at: http://ec.europa.eu/education/news/news1541_en.htm

The BFUG took note of the information provided in writing.

11. Next BFUG meetings, Brussels, 30 November-1 December 2009 & Madrid, 18-19 February 2010

- The BFUG agreed on the additional BFUG meeting on 30 November-1 December 2009 in Brussels, hosted by the Flemish Community of Belgium.

Timing

November 30, 3-5.30 p.m. : first part of BFUG meeting

December 1, morning+ early afternoon until 3.30 pm : seminar on the independent assessment of the Bologna Process organised by the European

Commission.

December 1, 4 to 6 pm: second part of BFUG meeting.

BFUG members are also invited to join the testing seminar on reports on funding and governance in higher education organised by the European Commission on December 2 in Brussels.

- The BFUG took note of the information provided by Spain on the meeting in Madrid, 18-19 February 2009.

12. Any other business

The Chair announced that Marie-Anne Persoons (Bologna Secretariat) and Denise Heiligers (Netherlands) had participated in the BFUG for the last time and on behalf of the BFUG thanked them for their valuable contribution over the past ten and two years respectively.